



# Flying in the Face of Criminalization

The Safety Implications of  
Prosecuting Aviation  
Professionals for  
Accidents

**SOFIA MICHAELIDES-MATEOU**  
**ANDREAS MATEOU**

# FLYING IN THE FACE OF CRIMINALIZATION

*This page has been left blank intentionally*

# Flying in the Face of Criminalization

The Safety Implications of Prosecuting Aviation  
Professionals for Accidents

SOFIA MICHAELIDES-MATEOU

&

ANDREAS MATEOU

ASHGATE

© Sofia Michaelides-Mateou and Andreas Mateou 2010

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Sofia Michaelides-Mateou and Andreas Mateou have asserted their right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, to be identified as the authors of this work.

Published by

Ashgate Publishing Limited

Wey Court East

Union Road

Farnham

Surrey, GU9 7PT

England

www.ashgate.com

Ashgate Publishing Company

Suite 420

101 Cherry Street

Burlington

VT 05401-4405

USA

### **British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

Michaelides-Mateou, Sofia.

Flying in the face of criminalization : the safety implications of prosecuting aviation professionals for accidents.

1. Aircraft accidents--Investigation--Law and legislation. 2. Malpractice. 3. Prosecution. 4. Evidence (Law) 5. Aircraft accidents--Prevention. I. Title II. Mateou, Andreas. 346'.0322-dc22

ISBN: 978-1-4094-0767-6 (hbk)

978-1-4094-0768-3 (ebk)

### **Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data**

Michaelides-Mateou, Sofia, 1965-

Flying in the face of criminalization : the safety implications of prosecuting aviation professionals for accidents / by Sofia Michaelides-Mateou and Andreas Mateou.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-1-4094-0767-6 (hardback) -- ISBN 978-1-4094-0768-3 (ebook)

1. Aircraft accidents--United States. 2. Aircraft accidents--United States--Prevention. 3. Air pilots--United States. I. Mateou, Andreas. II. Title.

TL553.5.M43 2010

363.12'460973--dc22

2010022183

Reprinted in 2011.



**Mixed Sources**

Product group from well-managed forests and other controlled sources  
www.fsc.org Cert no. SA-COC-1565  
© 1996 Forest Stewardship Council

Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
MPG Books Group, UK

# Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>List of Cases</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>About the Authors</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
Our Perspective	3
<b>2 What the Black Box Cannot Tell You – Liability in Law</b>	<b>7</b>
Legal Theory	8
Civil Liability – Negligence	9
Criminal Liability	20
Criminal Negligence	22
Manslaughter	25
Corporate Manslaughter	26
<b>3 The Greying of the Black Box – Aviation Accident Investigation</b>	<b>31</b>
The Purpose of an Investigation	31
ICAO Investigation	32
The Legal Framework of an Aviation Accident Investigation	34
Purpose of the Technical Investigation	37
Cause, or Probable Cause	39
Process of an Investigation	47
Level and Scope of an Investigation	48
Safety Recommendations	51
The Role of Accident Investigators	52
<b>4 Knowing and Doing</b>	<b>55</b>
British Airways Trident 3B and Inex-Adria Aviopromet DC-9 Mid-air Collision – Zagreb, Croatia (1976)	56
Air France A320 – Habsheim, France (1988)	57
Air Inter A320 Flight 148 – Mont Sainte-Odile, France (1992)	60
ValueJet MD DC-9-32 Accident – Florida, USA (1996)	61
Aerosweet Yakovlev-42 – Thessaloniki, Greece (1997)	62
LAPA Flight 3142 – Buenos Aires, Argentina (1999)	64

	Olympic Airway Falcon 900-B – Bucharest, Romania (1999)	67
	Singapore Airlines Boeing 747 – Singapore Chiang-KaiShek Airport, Taiwan (2000)	70
	Scandinavian Airlines (SAS) MD-87 and Cessna Jet – Milan Linate Airport, Italy (2001)	71
	Crossair Avro RJ100 – Zurich, Switzerland (2001)	73
	Piper – Winnipeg, Canada (2002)	75
	DHL B757 and Bashkirian Airlines Tu-154 Mid-air Collision – Uberlingen, Germany (2002)	80
	Tuninter ATR 72 – Italian Coast (2005)	83
	Helios Airways B737-300 – Grammatiko, Greece (2005)	85
	Gol Boeing 737 and Embraer Jet Collision – Amazon Jungle, Brazil (2006)	90
	Garuda Boeing 737-400 – Yogyakarta Airport, Indonesia (2007)	93
	Summary of Findings	96
<b>5</b>	<b>The Notion of Intermingling</b>	<b>99</b>
	Common Law Countries	101
	Civil Law Countries	107
	Use of the Technical Accident Report in Subsequent Litigation	116
	The Use of Data from the CVR and FDR in Subsequent Litigation	120
	Investigators' Testimony in Subsequent Litigation	125
	Conclusions	127
<b>6</b>	<b>The State of Play</b>	<b>129</b>
	Accident Investigation and Limitations	129
	External Pressures Exerted on Technical Investigations	133
	A European Accident Investigation Branch	136
	Use of CVR and FDR	137
	Testimony Provided	138
	Inconsistencies	141
	Consequences to Defendants	143
	Individuals Prosecuted	145
	European Aviation Court	149
	A European Accident Investigation Branch	150
	Alternatives to the European Accident Investigation Branch	151
<b>7</b>	<b>The Effect of Criminalization on Aviation Safety</b>	<b>153</b>
	Analysis of Pilots and Air Traffic Controllers Survey Results	155
	Comair	157
<b>8</b>	<b>The Way Forward</b>	<b>161</b>

<b>9</b>	<b>Cases of Prosecution of Aviation Professionals</b>	<b>165</b>
	Air France Transports Aériens Intercontinentaux DC-6, Cairo, Egypt (1956)	165
	Civil Air Transport Company, B727, Taipei, China (1968)	165
	Lufthansa B747, Nairobi, Kenya (1974)	166
	Zagreb Mid-air Collision, Trident 3B and DC-9, Croatia (Yugoslavia) (1976)	166
	SE-210 Super Caravelle of SATA, Madeira, Portugal (1977)	166
	Swiss Air DC-8, Athens Airport, Greece (1979)	167
	JAL DC-8, Tokyo, Japan (1982)	167
	THY B727-200, Ankara, Turkey (1983)	167
	Avensa DC-9, Barquisimeto, Venezuela (1983)	168
	JAL B747-SR, Tokyo, Japan (1985)	168
	TU-134A, Kuybyshev Airport, Russia (1986)	168
	Aero Traporti Italiani ATR 42, Milan, Italy (1987)	168
	Air France A320, Habsheim, France (1988)	169
	Korean Airlines DC10-30, Tripoli, Libya (1989)	169
	USAir Boeing 737, New York, USA (1989)	169
	British Airways B747, London Heathrow, UK (1989)	169
	Air Inter A320, Strasbourg, France (1992)	170
	Contactair DHC Dash 8, Paris, France (1993)	170
	Korean Air A300-600, Cheju, Korea – 1994	170
	New Zealand Ansett DHC-8, Palmerston North, New Zealand (1995)	170
	Inter Austral Airlines, Argentina (1995)	171
	ValuJet DC-9-32, Florida, USA (1996)	171
	Japan Airlines MacDonnell Douglas MD-11, Nagoya International Airport, Japan (1997)	172
	Ukrainian Yakovlev-42, Thessaloniki, Greece (1997)	172
	Delta Airlines B767-300, Schiphol Airport, Amsterdam, Netherlands (1998)	172
	LAPA Boeing 737-204C, Buenos Aires, Argentina (1999)	173
	Dassault Falcon 900B, Bucharest's Otopeni Airport, Romania (1999)	173
	British Airways, Girona Airport, Spain (1999)	174
	Alaska Airlines MD-83, California, USA (2000)	174
	Emery DC-8, California, USA (2000)	174
	Hapag Lloyd A310, Vienna, Austria (2000)	175
	Alliance B737-200, Patna Airport, India (2000)	175
	Concorde 203, Air France, Paris (2000)	175
	Air Glaciers Travel, Buson, Switzerland (2000)	176
	Singapore Airlines B747, Taiwan (2000)	176
	Japan Airlines B747 and McDonnell Douglas DC-10, Tokyo, Japan (2001)	176



SAS MD-87 and Cessna, Milan, Italy (2001)	177
Crossair Avro RJ100, Zurich, Switzerland (2001)	177
Air China CA129, Pusan, China (2002)	178
Piper, Winnipeg, Canada (2002)	178
DHL B757 Collision with a Bashkrian Airlines Tu 154, Uberlingen, Germany (2002)	178
Boeing 737-700 Flash Airlines, Sharm el-Sheikh International Airport, Egypt (2004)	179
Helvetic Airways DC-9-83, Pristina Airport, Kosovo (2004)	179
Challenger CL-600, Teterboro, New Jersey, USA (2005)	179
Tuninter ATR 72, Italy (2005)	180
Helios B737, Athens, Greece (2005)	180
Gol Airlines B737 Collision with an Embraer Legacy in Brazil (2006)	180
Canadian Jet, Vnukovo Airport, Russia (2007)	181
Garuda B737-400, Indonesia (2007 )	182
TAM Linhas Aéreas Airlines A320, Brazil (2007)	182
Boeing A75, Wisconsin, USA (2008)	182
Spanair MD-82, Madrid, Spain (2008)	183
Itek Air B737-200, Tehran, Iran (2008)	183
Airbus A320 Leased by XL Airways Germany A320, Perpignan, France (2008)	183
Air One Executive Cessna 650 Citation III, Rome, Italy (2009)	184

<i>References</i>	185
<i>Index</i>	201

# List of Figures

Figure 4.1	Relatives demanding justice	87
Figure 4.2	Letter of the President to deceased's relatives stating that action will be taken to bring to justice those responsible for the accident	88
Figure 6.1	Helios B737-300 pressurization panel	140
Figure 6.2	Helios B737 air conditioning control panel	140
Figure 6.3	Relatives attack defendants in the Helios case on their way to trial	145

*This page has been left blank intentionally*

# List of Abbreviations

AAIB	Air Accident Investigation Branch
AAIASB	Air Accident Investigation and Aviation Safety Board of the Hellenic Ministry of Transport and Communications
AIB	Accident Investigation Branch
ANO	Air navigation order
ATC	Air traffic control
ATCO	Air traffic controller
ATSB	Australian Transport Safety Bureau
BASI	The Bureau of Air Safety Investigation was the agency of the Australian government responsible for the investigation of accidents and incidents occurring to civil aircraft in Australia and its territories.
CAB	Civil Aeronautics Board
CVR	The cockpit voice recorder records communication between the flight crew and between the flight crew and air traffic control, the automated radio weather briefings, any conversation between the pilots and ground or cabin staff as well as any other sounds inside the cockpit. It consists of a cockpit area microphone, usually located on the overhead instrument panel between the two pilots, a data storage module and an underwater locator beacon (ULB). The microphone records all sounds in the cockpit, including engine noise, radio transmissions, explosions and voices.
DFDR	Digital flight data recorder – records all aspects of pitch, yaw and roll and all other flying, engine and aerodynamic parameters.
DME	Distance measuring equipment
FAA	Federal Aviation Authority

FL	Flight Level
FOM	Flight operation manuals
GPWS	Ground Proximity Warning System
IAS	Indicated Airspeed
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
IFATCA	International Federation of Air Traffic Controllers' Associations
ILS	Instrument Landing System
ISASI	International Society of Air Safety Investigators
LDSM	Legal Defensive Safety Management
MEL	Minimum Equipment List
NTSB	National Transportation Safety Board
PIC	Pilot in command
RPT	Regular public transport
RVSM	Reduced vertical separation minimum
Rwy	Runway – A defined rectangular area on a land aerodrome prepared for the landing and take-off of aircraft.
SIDs	Standard Instrument Departures
TCAS	Traffic Alert and Collision Avoidance System
TSB	Transport Safety Board of Canada
UTC	Coordinated Universal Time
VOR	Very High Frequency Omnidirectional Range

# List of Cases

*Adomako* [1995] 1 A.C. 171.

*AG's Reference (No. 3 of 1994)* [1997] 3 WLR 421.

*Australian National Airlines Commission v The Commonwealth of Australia & Canadian Pacific Airlines* [1975] High Court of Australia, reported at (1974-5) 132CLR 582 on other issues.

*Blyth v Birmingham Waterworks Co* [1856]11 Ex 781.

*Bolam v Friern Hospital Management Committee* [1957] 1 WLR 583.

*Brooks v United States* [5th Cir. 1983] 695 F. 2d 984, 987.

*The Bywell Castle* [1879] 4 PD 219.

*Capital and Counties plc v Hampshire County Council* (1997) 2 All ER 865.

*Caparo Industries Plc v Dickman* [1990] 2 A.C. 605.

*City of New Orleans, Etc. v American Commercial, Etc.* [5th Cir. 1981] 662 F 2d 1121, 1123.

*Coatney v Berkshire* [1974] 500F 2d 290 (8th Cir).

*David R.Hinson, Administrator, FAA, v Hulbert G. Ferger.* [1994] NTSB Order No. EA-4228.

*Delta Airlines Inc. v US* [1977] 561 F2d 381 (1st Cir).

*Donoghue v Stevenson* [1932] AC 562 page12.

*DPP v Newbury* [1977] AC 500.

*FAA v NTSB* [1991] (Columbia Circuit) argued 8 April, 1999; decided 21 September, 1999; No. 98-1365.

*Glasgow Corp. v Muir* [1943] AC 448.

*Goldman v Thai Airways International Ltd* [1983] 1 WLR 118.

*Hartz v United States* [1965] 249 F.Supp.119.

*Hayes v United States* [5th Cir. 1990] 899 F.2d 438.

*Hedley Byrne & Co v Heller & Partners Ltd* [1964] 2 QB 412.

*Hill v Chief Constable of West Yorkshire* [1988] 2 All ER 238.

*Joseph M. Del Balzo Acting Administrator, FAA v Ray Edward Delgant, Jr.*[1993]. NTSB Order No. EA-3954.

*Kack v United States* [D.Minn. 1977] 432, F.Supp. 633,624-35.

*Lochgelly Iron & Cool Co. v M'Mullan* [1934] AC. 1.  
*Long v Clinton Aviation Co.* [1950] C.A. Colo.

*Marion C. Blakey, Administrator, FAA v Peachie D. Tianvan* [2003], NTSB Order No. EA-5050.

*McInnery v McDougall* [1938] 1 DLR 22, [1937] 3 WWR 625, 7 FLJ (Can) 227.

*Nettleship v Weston* [1971] 2 QB. 691.

*Nicole v Simmonds* [1975] WAR 1 W Aust SC.

*Overseas Tankship (UK) Ltd v Morts. Docks & Engineering Co. Ltd* [1961] AC 388.

*People v Crossan* 87 Cal. App. 5, 261 p531 (Cal. Dist. Ct. App.1927).

*Philcox v Civil Aviation Authority.* The Times. 8 June 1995.

*Re Air Crash at Lexington, Ky,* Aug. 27, 2006, 2007 WL 4321865 (E.D. Ky. Dec. 6, 2008)

*Re Air Crash Near Cali* [1995] 959 F. Supp. 1529 (S.D. Fla. 1977).

*R v Bateman* [1925] 28 Cox's Crim Cas 33.

*R v Beatty* [2008] SCC 5 (CanLII), 2008 SCC 5, [2008] 1 S.C.R. 49.

*R v Caldwell* [1982] A.C. 341 354.

*R v Church* [1966] 1 QB 59, *R v Dawson* (1985) 81 Cr App R 150.

*R v Franklin* [1883] 15 Cox CC 163.

*R v J.F.*, 2008 SCC 60 (Can LII), 2008 SCC 60, [2008] 3 S.C.R. 215.

*R v P & O Ferries (Dover) Ltd* [1990] 93 Cr App R 72.

*R v Tayfel* (M.) [2009] MBCA 124 (CanLII).

*R v Waite* reflex [1986] 28 C.C.C. (3d) 326 (Ont. C.A.)

*R v Woolin* [1999] 1 A.C. 82; [1998] 3 W.L.R. 382; [1998] 4 All E.R. 103.

*Saif Ali v Sydney Mitchell & Co.* [1980] AC 198.

*Shankle v United States* [5th Cir. 1986] 796 F. 2d 742, 745.

*Société Air France et al v Greater Toronto Airport Authority* [2009] Ontario Superior Court of Justice, Court File No: 07-CV-337564, 05-CV-294746, 07-CV-337545, 07-CV-336943, Date: 20091209.

*Susanne Yvonne Andrews v British Airways* [2008] EWCA Civ 1308.

*Taylor v Alidar Ltd* [1976] IRLR 420 & [1978] IRLR 82 CA..

Tribunal de Grande Instance de Colmar, Département du Haut – Rhin. 14 Mars 1997. *Jugement No 464/97*

*Voli v Inglewood Shire Council* [1963] 110 CLR 74.

*Wagon Mound (The), The No. 1* [1961] see *Overseas Tankship (UK) Ltd v Morts Docks & Engineering Co* [1961] UKPC 1, [1961] AC 388, [1961] 1 All ER 404.

*White Estate v E&B Helicopters Ltd* [2008] BCSC 12.

*X (minors) v Bedfordshire CC* [1995] 3 All ER 353.

*Yates v US* [1974] 497 F 2d 878 at 882-3 (10th Circ).



*This page has been left blank intentionally*

# About the Authors

**Dr. Sofia Michaelides-Mateou** Sofia holds a Doctorate from the University of Middlesex, UK, a BA and a law degree (LLB) from the University of Witwatersrand, South Africa. She practised law in South Africa before returning to Cyprus to start her academic career and is currently an Associate Professor in the Law Department, University of Nicosia and is a guest lecturer, at Cranfield University, UK.

Sofia is a member of the Just Culture Task Force of Eurocontrol, an Associate Member of ISASI and a Member of the Executive Board of the Flight Safety Foundation – SE Europe-Cyprus (FSF-SEC). Sofia was an advisor to the Cyprus Air Accident and Incident Investigation Board (AAIIB). She attended a number of CRM, Safety and Quality Management System and Accident Investigation courses. Sofia has published articles on numerous aviation areas, has presented many papers in international aviation conferences and is the author of the book, ‘Air Law: A Practical Perspective’. She is an aviation-legal consultant who has participated in a number of aviation litigation cases and currently a director of MM Aviation Consultancy Ltd, now renamed Alstco Aviation Ltd.

**Captain Dr. Andreas Mateou** Captain Andreas Mateou holds a Doctorate from the University of Middlesex, UK, a MSc in Aviation Management from the University of New South Wales, Australia and a law degree (LLB) from the University of London. He was Head of Flight Safety, the Head of the Flight Data Monitoring Program and the Head of the Emergency Response Programme of Cyprus Airways for a number of years. He has 25 years flying experience with more than 16000 flying hours and is a Type Rating Instructor and Examiner on the Airbus A320. He is also a part-time lecturer in Law at the University of Nicosia and is a guest lecturer at Cranfield University, UK.

Andreas has written extensively on aviation topics and participated in a number of aviation conferences. He is an Associate Member of ISASI and has been an aviation safety and legal consultant in a number of aviation litigation cases and is a director of MM Aviation Consultancy Ltd, now re-named Alstco Aviation Ltd.

*This page has been left blank intentionally*

# Acknowledgements

Achieving a success and attaining goals are never possible without the support and assistance of a diverse group of persons. We would like to express our deepest gratitude to all those who were instrumental and without whom the book would not have been feasible.

This book would not have been possible without the assistance of the respondents and interviewees who participated in our doctoral dissertation, whom we dearly thank.

Our thanks also goes to Dr Paul Gibbs for his never-ending motivation and guidance and Dr Graham Braithwaite for his invaluable assistance. A special thanks goes to our research assistant Chrystel Erotokritou for all her help.

Last but not least we would like to express a special acknowledgement to our parents for all their support and encouragement; our children, Evyania and Stephanos for their patience and above all to each other for the continuous thought-provoking discussions and hard work that went into the book.